Out of school activities and the education gap

Emily Tanner, Jenny Chanfreau, Meg Callanan, Amy Skipp, Jonathan Paylor – NatCen Social Research
Liz Todd, Karen Laing, Laura Mazzoli-Smith – Newcastle University

14 July 2016
Contents

- Research aims and methods
- Findings
  - Variation in participation
  - Activities and outcomes
- Implications for policy and research
Research aims and methods
Why investigate out of school activities

- Attainment gap at 11
- How children spend their time
- The role of schools in supporting learning and wider outcomes
- Understanding *how* activities can influence outcomes

Definition: organised activities with adult supervision
Research questions

How do children spend their time outside of school?
- Are there patterns in children’s formal and informal time use?
- Does this vary according to background characteristics?

Does children’s time use affect outcomes at age 11?
- What types of activities are associated with outcomes?
- What are the mechanisms?
- Does this vary according to background?
Methods

- Review of literature and theories of change
- Analysis of Millennium Cohort Study linked to NPD
- Qualitative case studies in primary schools in North East and South East
Out of school activities in the MCS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age 5</th>
<th>Age 7</th>
<th>Age 11</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Breakfast club</td>
<td>Breakfast club</td>
<td>Breakfast club</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afterschool club</td>
<td>Afterschool club</td>
<td>Afterschool club</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal childcare</td>
<td>Formal childcare</td>
<td>Formal childcare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informal childcare</td>
<td>Informal childcare</td>
<td>Informal childcare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious class</td>
<td>Religious class</td>
<td>Religious class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Extra tuition</td>
<td>Extra tuition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other club</td>
<td>Music lesson</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Physical activity with friends and family, playing games with parents, seeing friends, watching TV, playing computer games, reading for enjoyment, doing homework, doing chores, caring, playing a musical instrument.
Outcome measures

Academic attainment outcomes
- Key Stage 2 total point score
- Achieved Level 5 in Maths
- Achieved Level 5 in English

Social, emotional and behavioural outcomes
- SDQ total difficulties score
- SDQ prosocial score
Variation in activity participation
Sport participation by mother’s education

Base: All children

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education Level</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>11</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NVQ1</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 GCSE A-C</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-levels</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postgraduate</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Participation at age 11 and disadvantage

Breakfast club
- Disadvantaged: 14
- Not disadvantaged: 12

After school club
- Disadvantaged: 32
- Not disadvantaged: 32

Sports club
- Disadvantaged: 61
- Not disadvantaged: 77

Religious activity
- Disadvantaged: 24
- Not disadvantaged: 13

Extra tuition
- Disadvantaged: 20
- Not disadvantaged: 26

Music lessons
- Disadvantaged: 6
- Not disadvantaged: 26
Some parents maybe aren’t confident enough to take their children along to a club … whereas here because it’s after school it’s a familiar environment … I think a lot of the things here maybe the children wouldn’t get to do if they weren’t doing it at after school club.

Source: parent, North East
Activities and outcomes
Findings for all children

Participation in **sport/physical activities** associated with higher attainment and better social, emotional and behavioural outcomes at age 11:
- Taking part in sports at age 7 and 11 associated with higher odds of achieving Level 5 in maths compared with children who didn’t do sports.
- Frequency of informal sports activities at age 7 also positively associated with KS2 attainment, but not when controlling for KS1 attainment.
- Sport also associated with lower difficulties score and higher odds of achieving high prosocial score.

Participation in ‘**other clubs**’ at 7 associated with higher attainment at age 11 (Level 5 maths and total points score)

**Reading for enjoyment** and hours per week on **homework** at age 11 positively associated with total point score at KS2 and prosocial skills.

---

‘Other clubs’ could include Cubs/Brownies, arts, crafts, chess, drama etc
Findings for disadvantaged children

Participation in after school clubs the only activity related to outcomes:
- Those attending at all 3 time points or age 7 and 11 had higher TPS on average.
- Effect strengthened when controlling for KS1 attainment.
- Also associated with prosocial skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation Status</th>
<th>Average Predicted Key Stage 2 Total Point Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Never used</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Started/ continuous</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non disadvantaged</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Implications
46% children aged 11 play out unsupervised each week
21% hardly ever play out

46% read for pleasure every day
53% help with chores several times a week
32% attend after school clubs
73% attend sports clubs

26% children aged 11 not disadvantage have music lessons
6% disadvantaged children have music lessons
Grouping through participation at structured activities: % disadvantaged children

- Self directed Social 47%
- Extra Instruction 37%
- Hobbies 14%
- Extended School 7%
- Granny & sports 12%
- Busy Structured 4%

% in total sample: SDS 30%, H 26%, G&S 19%, EI 14%, ES 8%, BS 5%
Private tuition

Scholarisation of childhood?

Varies according to region, ethnicity, disadvantage at age 11:

42-48% Chinese, Black, Indian origin and other ethnic groups
20% White
26% Not disadvantaged
20% Disadvantage

London 43%
East Midlands 21%
North East 11%
Scotland 5%
Head teachers on clubs

... in order to do the writing in particular, if they haven’t had these experiences, they can’t write...

The easier we make it for them to access the services they need the more successful their children are going to be

Its just about discipline and children sort of valuing the school… ‘I’m going to try really hard for Mr such and such...
What can we conclude about after school clubs?

After school clubs offered as part of multiple policy changes, from extended schools to pupil premium
All schools to offer clubs? Targetted? Subsidised? Theory of change to suggest causal link attainment?
For discussion

- Does the evidence support interpretation beyond association?
- What is it about after school clubs that may promote positive outcomes?
- How important is the child’s agency in participating in activities?
- How much activity is too much?
- What is/should the role of schools be in supporting out of hours learning?
- Is there a case for a longer school day?
Thank you

If you want further information or would like to contact the authors,

Emily Tanner
Head of Children, Families & Work
T. 020 7549 8580
E. emily.tanner@natcen.ac.uk

Visit us online, natcen.ac.uk
Research briefs and CLS working paper available:
http://natcen.ac.uk/our-research/research/out-of-school-activities/

Liz Todd
Professor of Educational Inclusion
Deputy Director of the Institute for Social Renewal
Newcastle University
E. liz.todd@ncl.ac.uk